

Antiracist Environmentalism

By Carlton Waterhouse, J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law
Howard University School of Law

Environmental Protection without Equity is Unsustainable

A world in which poverty and inequity are endemic will always be prone to ecological and other crises.—*Our Common Future*

- In the United States, environmental organizations and institutions pay far too little attention to social equity in their policies and practices.

US Environmental Racial Disparities Abound

Air Pollution

- NO₂ pollutant exposure between people of color and whites is 38%
- Low income whites have lower exposure than high income Latinos
- NO₂ causes asthma, other respiratory ailments, and heart disease the disparity accounts for 7000 additional deaths

Lead Exposure and Poisoning

- African American children remain up to four times more likely to have elevated blood lead levels than their white counterparts

Black-white Disparities in Asthma Rates Rose from 1999 to 2011

- At the end of this period, black children were twice as likely as white children to have asthma and had increased rates of asthma attacks and death compares with their white counterparts.
- Low socioeconomic status also was associated with increased prevalence of asthma. Asthma rates were highest among the lowest income earners and high-school dropouts.
- Racial differences in asthma rates persisted, however, even after accounting for income and education.

What Causes these Environmental Inequities?

- Pervasive environmental injustices like these in America are the manifestation of past and ongoing institutional practices that favor white racial identity and upper middle class and upper-class socioeconomic status.
- In short, most disparities are the direct result of past and present racism.

Race, Class, and Gender are Social Phenomenon and Requires Social Analysis

Historic Manifestations

- Race Based
Conquest/Slavery/Segregation
- Gender Based
Ownership/Education/Political
rights

Social Components

- Legal
- Economic
- Political

Social Dominance Theory

Group domination is a universal trait across societies although the intensity and the bases change across societies and across time within societies.*

*See Social Dominance: An Intergroup Theory of Social Hierarchy and Oppression, Jim Sidanius and Felicia Pratto

Social Dominance Theory Explained

Human societies tend to organize as group-based social hierarchies in which at least one group enjoys greater social status and power than other groups.

Universal Phenomenon

Regardless of:

Governmental form

Religion

Economic system

Social Dominance/Hierarchy Axes

Three types of dominance

- Age
- Gender
- Arbitrary Set

Male Dominance

- The gender system reflects a disproportionate distribution of political and military power as well as commercial and economic power to men over women.

Arbitrary Set Dominance

- Arbitrary set groups are distinguished by characteristics like religion, clan, tribe, nationality, indigeneity, class, ethnicity, and race.
- Intersectionality places some individuals at the absolute pinnacle of the social hierarchy and others at its nadir.

White Racial Dominance

- Racial dominance reflects the disproportionate distribution of wealth, income, employment, professions, business ownership, executive offices and board membership, political power, quality housing, security, educational attainment of non Hispanic whites over other groups.

Environmental Benefits of Dominance



Environmental Benefits of Dominance

- Access to clean green spaces (e.g., parks & wilderness)
- Clean drinking water in homes
- Clean soils and surface water in residential communities
- Higher resilience to natural disasters
- Greater control over local land use decisions
- Control over environmental decision making

Environmental Costs of Subordination

- Higher risks and lower resilience to natural disasters
- Less access to clean drinking water
- Soil and surface water contamination
- Close proximity to waste facilities
- Increased pollution exposure in homes, schools and jobs
- Increased morbidity and disease

Hurricane Katrina



Flint Water Crisis



Fence Line Communities



The Three Mechanisms of Dominance

- Social Ideologies and Beliefs
- Institutional Structures
- Individual Preferences

Hierarchy Enhancing Beliefs / Ideologies

- Societal beliefs or ideas that support existing social hierarchy(ies) based on moral or intellectual justifications
- Culture of poverty, white supremacy, just world beliefs, meritorious karma, the divine right of kings, Manifest Destiny...

Hierarchy Enhancing beliefs in the environmental context

- Class determines environmental quality
- Real estate costs determine waste facility location
- People of color moved to polluted areas
- Environmental protection is race and class neutral
- Racial discrimination requires racial animus

Hierarchy Attenuating Beliefs and Ideologies

- Societal beliefs/ideas that undermine social hierarchy
- Human rights, civil rights, feminism, womanism, socialism, ethnic/racial pride...

Hierarchy Attenuating Beliefs in the environmental context

- Environmental racism
- People are entitled to environmental justice
- Community centered environmental decision-making
- Implicit race and gender bias
- Intersectional race and gender discrimination in corporate boards and executive offices

Hierarchy Enhancing Institutions

- Reproduce and maintain social hierarchy through their allocation of more positive social value to dominant groups.
- Financial institutions, government agencies, criminal justice systems, and corporations represent hierarchy enhancing institutions.

Hierarchy Enhancing Environmental Institutions

- Environmental organizations that protect “everyone” without regard to existing social inequality further status quo injustices through neglect and ignorance.
- In the same way that animals will have distinct impacts upon them as a result of human development based on their location, different human communities experience the impacts of pollution differently based on their locations as well.

Hierarchy Enhancing Environmental Institutions

- Institutions and the individuals within them readily replicate dominance without thinking.
- Challenging dominance requires social participants to make waves and buck systems that usually come at some cost.
- This asymmetrical relationship grounds and cements hierarchy. Institutions committed to traditions and policies that are “hierarchy neutral” routinely maintain and perpetuate hierarchy as a direct result.

Hierarchy Enhancing Environmental Institutions

- Through presupposed neutrality and the imagined transcendence of race, class, and gender hierarchy in environmental quality and environmental decision-making.
- A focus on global problems or protection of uninhabited spaces falsely appears outside the boundaries of social dominance by ignoring or minimizing the significance of the status quo inequities.

Hierarchy Enhancing Environmental Institutions

- EPA
- State Environmental Agencies
- Environmental non-profit organizations
- Waste disposal corporations
- Local land use boards

No Neutral Ground

- Environmental decision-making takes place within the context of the nation's social dominance paradigm.
- Institutions making environmental decisions either challenge or conform to the existing social dominance norms of action and ideological outlook.

Hierarchy Attenuating Institutions

- These institutions provide disproportionate assistance to members of subordinate groups.
- Religious organizations aiding the poor, civil and human rights organizations, and welfare organizations are considered hierarchy attenuating institutions.

Hierarchy Attenuating Institutions

- Rather than a function of individual group-based malice, environmental inequity also results from social processes designed and operated in favor of dominant groups.
- Reproducing hierarchy is to riding with the current but minimizing hierarchy is to paddling upstream.

Hierarchy Attenuating Environmental Institutions

- Grassroots environmental justice groups
- The Deep South Center for Environmental Justice
- We Act for Environmental Justice
- Howard University School of Law Environmental Justice Center 😊

Environmental Consequences of Social Dominance

- In America, race and class hierarchy independently and jointly frame the environmental quality of the places where people live, work, and play.
- Moreover, the distribution of the benefits and burdens of pollution flow inversely along the axes of race, class, and gender hierarchy.

Environmental Consequences of Social Dominance

- The economic benefits flow upward to corporate executives, shareholders, political decision makers and their constituencies.
- The burdens of pollution run down the race axes concentrating exposure to harmful air pollutants, contaminated subsistence fish stocks, and proximity to hazardous and other solid wastes to people of color across economic strata.

Antiracist Solutions

- Antiracist environmentalism rejects practices and policies that distribute environmental burdens and benefits along gender, class, race, national origin, and citizenship lines.
- Instead it advances policies and practices that promote racial equality as an indispensable ingredient in sustaining and enhancing environmental quality.